



Review: [untitled]

Author(s): Manuel Molina

Reviewed work(s):

Tablettes cunéiformes de Tello au Musée d'Istanbul datant de l'époque de la IIIe dynastie d'Ur by Bertrand Lafont ; Fatma Yildiz

Source: *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, Vol. 121, No. 1 (Jan. - Mar., 2001), pp. 143-144

Published by: American Oriental Society

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/606761>

Accessed: 22/06/2009 06:28

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=aos>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit organization founded in 1995 to build trusted digital archives for scholarship. We work with the scholarly community to preserve their work and the materials they rely upon, and to build a common research platform that promotes the discovery and use of these resources. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



American Oriental Society is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of the American Oriental Society*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

latter translation. First of all, debtors are identified as slave, donkey-driver, or “bought man,” and the merchant acts in precisely the role we expect of him, namely that of creditor. The insolvent debtors impress their nails into the tablets, making them subordinates of the governor of Kalḫu who has paid off their debts. Creditors who receive their money back have absolutely no reason to do this. Finally, the semantic ambivalence of many other *bēl* constructions can be adduced as support for the translation “debtor.”

Pp. 280–83 (5), (20), (26): Instead of “*der Ausgang ist inkludiert*,” I would translate “mutual exit” (*BiOr* 50 [1993]: 434).

P. 293: Pigs, piglets, and lard all occur in the Practical Vocabulary of Assur, which might be taken as an indication that in Neo-Assyrian times pigs were taboo only in certain circles.

Pp. 384ff.: A comparison between table XI.2.C.b.2.1, *Verpfändung von Feldern*, and XI.2.C.b.2.2, *Verpachtung von Feldern*, is complicated by the absence of the size of the plots in the second table. A more detailed study of these texts to appear in *Rainfall and Agriculture in Northern Mesopotamia* (ed. R. M. Jas) will stress the resemblances between the two groups.

R. M. JAS

VRIJE UNIVERSITEIT AMSTERDAM

Tablettes cunéiformes de Tello au Musée d'Istanbul datant de l'époque de la III^e dynastie d'Ur. By BERTRAND LAFONT and FATMA YILDIZ. Publications de l'Institut historique-archéologique néerlandais de Stamboul, vol. 77. Leiden: NEDERLANDS HISTORISCH-ARCHAEOLOGISCH INSTITUUT TE ISTANBUL, 1996. Pp. 395, illustrations.

The book under review (*TCTI* 2) is the second part of *TCTI* 1 published in 1989, and completes the edition of the Ur III texts catalogued by H. de Genouillac in *ITT* 2/1. B. Lafont and F. Yildiz have published here, as usual in exemplary fashion, a large number of Ur III administrative texts.

The volume includes an “Introduction” (pp. 7–9 in French, pp. 11–12 in Turkish) where the authors explain their criteria for the transliteration of numbers, many other aspects regarding the structure of the book, and the conventions used. They also reiterate here that Ur III documents are “*véritables matériaux pour l'histoire*.” Next follows a careful and precise chronological and thematic classification of the texts (pp. 13–28).

One misses here a list of those texts previously published. This information can only be found with the transliteration of each text. There the following references should be added:

L. 2751: T. Fish and M. Lambert, “‘Vérification’ dans la Bureaucratie sumérienne,” *RA* 57 (1963): 96, no. 15.

L. 3372: P. Michalowski, *Letters from Early Mesopotamia* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1993), 99, no. 186.

L. 3390: M. Lambert, “Les archives de Urabba fils de Bazig,” *RA* 54 (1960): 128, no. 31.

L. 3418: P. Michalowski, *Letters*, 110, no. 220.

L. 3538: H. Neumann, “Zum privaten Werkvertrag im Rahmen der neusumerischen handwerklichen Produktion,” *AoF* 23 (1996): 257–59.

L. 3600: P. Michalowski, *Letters*, 60, no. 89.

L. 3608: P. Michalowski, *Letters*, 98, no. 185.

L. 3649: H. de Genouillac, “Notes lexicographiques,” *RA* 7 (1909): 161.

L. 3704: G. Pettinato, “Aggiunte al *corpus* di lettere amministrative della Terza Dinastia di Ur,” *OA* 7 (1968): 171, no. 5.

L. 3757: M. Lambert, “L’usage de l’argent-métal à Lagash au temps de la III^e Dynastie d’Ur (suite),” *RA* 57 (1963): 197, no. 52.

L. 3859: B. Lafont, “L’extraction du minerai de cuivre en Iran à la fin du III^e millénaire,” in *Tablettes et images aux Pays de Sumer et d’Akkad. Mélanges offerts à Monsieur H. Limet*, ed. Ö. Tunca and D. Deheselle (Liège: Université de Liège, 1996), 89.

L. 4123: M. Lambert, *RA* 57 (1963): 197, no. 53.

L. 4338 [“*époque akkadienne*”]: G. Pettinato, *OA* 7 (1968): 177, no. 18.

The “Transcriptions” constitute the main part of the book (pp. 31–266). Indeed, there one can find (from L. 2544 to L. 4713) the transliteration of almost 1350 texts. The authors have also included bibliographical references and—when possible and necessary—collations to the more than one hundred tablets already published in copy by H. de Genouillac in *ITT* 2/1. The layout for each text is consistent: museum number; numerical reference to seal impressions if necessary, the latter described in the “*Liste des empreintes de sceaux*” on pp. 269–77 (it would also have been convenient if the seal legend had been included after the transliteration of each text); date; transliteration. The absence of autographed texts is compensated for by the addition of accurate copies for badly preserved or less intelligible parts of the tablets.

After the aforementioned list of seals there are a very useful and valuable section devoted to “Notes et commentaires aux textes” (pp. 279–94), and excellent indexes of personal names (pp. 295–347), divine names (pp. 349–51), geographical and topographical names (pp. 353–60), as well as a glossary (pp. 361–95). The volume concludes with “*Addenda et corrigenda*” (p. 397) to *TCTI* 1 and 2.

It has to be emphasized that the quality of this work is more than excellent. The following notes, therefore, are but minor comments and should not detract from the high value of the volume.

L. 2567: 3 and *passim* (see p. 369): A better reading for *gan-tuš* would be *gan-dab₅*; see W. Heimpel, “The Industrial Park of Girsu in the Year 2042 B.C. Interpretation of an Archive Assembled by P. Mander,” *JAOS* 118 (1998): 398.

L. 2677: 2: In the commentary to this line (p. 281), the authors suggest that the expression *á-ḫun-gá mu-kúr-ra* “*dépend*

du sens qu'il faut donner à MU; on peut ainsi comprendre: 'travailleurs embauchés aux noms étrangers', ou bien: 'travailleurs embauchés qui ont été changés' (ce qui pourrait peut-être correspondre *grosso modo* aux *nasîhû* des textes de Mari)." I believe that the latter suggestion is most probable, since in a few Ur III texts workers or recipients of rations are qualified as *kûr* "replaced" (MVN 15, 66: 14–15; BCT 1, 131:18, 21; Gomi, *Oriental* 21 [1985]: 6 [BM 106075]:r. iii 3; BM 13667: *passim* = Molina, MVN 22, forthcoming).

L. 2707: 3 and *passim* (see pp. 372–73): *lû-ĤU.KU.BU*: W. Heimpel (JAOS 118 [1998]: 396–97) has recently proposed interpreting this term as a designation for "invalids." He understands it as an example of an Akkadian *purrusu*-form (*ĥuK-KuBu*). Even if Heimpel's translation is correct, I can hardly agree with his morphological interpretation of the word, since it does not take into account the graphic variants. These have been briefly discussed by M. Civil (review of B. Lafont, *Documents administratifs sumériens*, *AuOr* 7 [1989]: 147), who lists the following writings: *lû KU.ĤU.BU*, *ĤU.BU.KU*, *lû ĥu-bu*, and even *ĥu-KU*¹ (TCS 1, 42: 4); accordingly he proposed reading *lû ĥu-bu*^{bu}. It must be noticed, however, that *lû ĥu-KU*¹ in TCS 1, 42: 4 is written *lû ĥu-LU*, a variant which is also attested beside *lû ĤU.LU.BU* (for example, MVN 2, 232: r. 15) in other texts belonging to the "Archive of the Kennelmen" (an exhaustive study of these variants by P. Mander is forthcoming).

L. 2810 iii 4, L. 3354: 3 and *passim* (see pp. 305, 371): the PN or PrN transliterated by Lafont and Yıldız as GĀL.DI (PN) or GĪŠGAL.DI (PrN) is perhaps to be read as U₁₈-di: see P. Attinger, *Éléments de linguistique sumérienne: la construction de du₁₁/e/di "dire"* (Fribourg: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1993), 737; for the second element cf. *ì-bí-la GĪŠGAL-di-da-ke₄-ne*, BM 22871: 5', 13' (M. Molina, "Some Neo-Sumerian Legal Texts in the British Museum," *Zwischen Sumer und Ebla, Festschrift G. Pettinato*, no. 3, forthcoming).

L. 2816 iv 8 provides a new example of the otherwise rarely attested term for the "branding" tool, *si-im-da* (for which see D. A. Foxvog, "Sumerian Brands and Branding-Irons," ZA 85 [1995]: 5–6): 1 *eme₆ si-im-da* ^dNin-gir-su *lû-nu-tuk* "nobody has one female ass branded with the mark of Ningirsu." This term is also found in an interesting Ur III legal text in the British Museum (BM 27844), which may be worth quoting. It reads as follows: (obv.) ¹ *lûr si-im-da* / ^dNin-gi-š-zi-da, ² Ur-^dNun-gal sipa nin, ³ anše-mu-um *bí-in-du₁₁*, ⁴ *inim-ni [b]í-in-gi*, ⁵ *en-na* ¹*inim*¹-*bí* *ì-til*, ⁶ *lû-inim-ma-bi ì-im-^dDU*¹-e (rev.) ¹ *lû¹-^dNa-rú-a*, ² *šabra dumu Ur-^dBa-ba₆ / ì-dab₅*, ³ *šà*¹ *É-gibil₄-le^{ki}*, *Seal*, ⁴ *iti*¹ *ezem-^dDumu-zi*, ⁵ *mu dumu-mí lugal ensí*, ⁶ *Za-ab-ša-li^{ki}-ke₄ / ba-an-tuk*; (Seal:) *Lú-^dNa-rú-a*, *dub-sar*, *dumu Ur-[^dBa-ba₆]*. "One male ass branded with the mark of Ningišzida: Ur-Nungal, the shepherd of the queen, has declared: 'the donkey is mine!' He has confirmed his statement. The litigation has been closed until he brings the witnesses. Lu-Narua, the prefect, son of Ur-Baba, took (the donkey) in charge. In Egibile. Month VI. ISS. (Seal of) Lu-Narua, scribe, son of Ur-Baba." (I am grateful

to the Trustees of the British Museum for their kind permission to quote the contents of this tablet.)

L. 3211: 1, L. 3240: 1 and *passim* (see p. 370): *gi-zi* and *gi-NE* are not to be considered graphic variants of the same word: see H. Waetzoldt, "'Rohr' und dessen Verwendungsweisen anhand der neusumerischen Texte aus Umma," BSA 6 (1992): 129–30, 134–35.

L. 3264: 2 and *passim* (see p. 375): *É.TUM* is to be understood as *É^{tum}* (*bitum*), not *kit-tum*: see W. Heimpel, review of A. Archi and F. Pomponio, *Testi cuneiformi neo-sumerici da Drehem*, JAOS 114 (1994): 280; T. Maeda independently arrived at the same conclusion in "É-tum = *bitum*, not *kittum*," ASJ 18 (1996): 253.

L. 3495: 10: *Nag-ku₅* is probably to be read *káb-ku₅*: see W. Sallaberger, "Zur Lesung der Bewässerungseinrichtung NAG-kud = *káb-kud*," NABU 1991, no. 47.

We must be grateful to B. Lafont and F. Yıldız for having put at our disposal this superb edition of Ur III texts, which will no doubt contribute greatly to our understanding of the economy and society of southern Mesopotamia in this period.

MANUEL MOLINA

INSTITUTO DE FILOLOGÍA, CSIC

Drinking in Ancient Societies; History and Culture of Drinks in the Ancient Near East: Papers of a Symposium held in Rome, May 17–19, 1990. Edited by LUCIO MILANO. History of the Ancient Near East: Studies, vol. 6. Padua: SRI, 1994. Pp. xvi + 469, plates (paper).

Drinking in Ancient Societies ist unter den immer häufiger erscheinenden Symposiumsbänden einer der gelungensten.¹ Der Gegenstand ist kulturgeschichtlich hochinteressant; es wurde—bei einem Schwerpunkt in Mesopotamien und Nordsyrien (Ebla)—ein zeitlich und geographisch weiter Raum berücksichtigt (Ägypten, Welt des Alten Testaments, Iran, Ägäis), und der Band hat in dem Organisator L. Milano auch einen höchst kompetenten Herausgeber gefunden.²

Mehr noch als gemeinsames Essen fördert Trinken die Geselligkeit, führt Fremde zueinander, lässt Freundschaften ent-

¹ Der Rezensent entschuldigt sich wegen der stark verspäteten Anzeige. Ausführlicher besprochen wurde das Buch schon von M. Krebernik, ZA 86 (1996): 285–87, und R. D. Biggs, JNES 56 (1997): 233–24. Vgl. sonst *KeiBi*. 56: 743 und 57: 1199.

² Zu bedauern ist nur das Fehlen von Indizes, die den reichen Inhalt noch besser erschlossen hätten.